

## **Professional Qualification: An Analysis of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa New Teachers' Recruitment Policy**

Nasir Ahmad\*, Nasir Shaheen†, Sajjad Hussain‡

### **Abstract**

The purpose of this study was to analyze the Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa current teachers' recruitment policy decision by replacing pre-service professional qualification with nine-month induction programme at school level. This paper explores this policy decision on the basis of critical review of national education policies from *First All Pakistan National Conference 1947* to *National Education Policy 2017* and available literature in the field. The findings of the study were that the current teachers' recruitment policy was not in line with any of all the previous National Education Policies of Pakistan as well as with *National Education Policy 2017*. It was recommended that current recruitment policy for teachers' recruitment at school level of government of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa may be revised to make it in-line with *National Educational Policy 2017* to ensure quality education in Pakistan.

**Key words:** professional qualification; teacher's recruitment; teacher education; national education policies of Pakistan

### **Study Background**

Professional development of teachers has far reaching consequences for schools, students and overall society, because teachers play a very significant part in the progress of any community. They are the agents of change and contribute to the development of society in numerous ways. Firstly, they bring social change in their respective communities by serving them (Sofa, Thompson, & Kanton, 2019), Secondly, they are responsible for the quality of education system and that depends largely on teachers' subject based knowledge and their professional qualifications. Teachers play essential role in the promotion of quality education and good teachers are very important for the promotion of students' learning and academic skills (Akinsolu, 2010; & Oluremi, 2013).

Teachers at schools should have knowledge of the content they are teaching, they should also have sound knowledge of children

---

\*Assistant Professor of Education, Center for Education and Staff Training, University of Swat, Email: [nasir\\_cupid@uswat.edu.pk](mailto:nasir_cupid@uswat.edu.pk)

†Assistant Professor of Education, Center for Education and Staff Training, University of Swat, Email: [nasirshaheen@uswat.edu.pk](mailto:nasirshaheen@uswat.edu.pk)

‡Assistant Professor of Education, Center for Education and Staff Training, University of Swat, Email: [sajjadhussain@uswat.edu.pk](mailto:sajjadhussain@uswat.edu.pk)

psychological development and most advanced methods of teaching (pedagogy). Professionally qualified teacher is one who has full command on his subject, well versed in the details of the individual's psychological development and has the ability to use different teaching methods in classroom. Many other factors like class size (Hussain, Ahmad, Asma, & Hakim, 2017), learning styles (Munir, Ahmad, Hussain, & Ghani, 2018), classroom environment (Shaheen, Ahmad, & Shah, 2020) and other school variables play vital role in students' learning (Hussain, Ahmad & Khan, 2013).

Quality of education is highly dependent on quality of teachers. The relationships between teaching quality and students' academic achievement have captured the attention of policymakers and researchers around the world. Research studies in the past have consistently identified teachers' professional qualification as one of the most essential school-based factors in student's learning (Bowe & Gore, 2017; Darling-Hammond, 1997; Eryilmaz & Laslan, 1999; Gore, 2017; Henard & Roseveare, 2012; Hightower, et al., 2011; McCaffrey, et al., 2003; Schacter & Thum, 2004). Ibrahim (2000) also found that teachers' professional qualification contributes significantly towards students' higher academic achievement. Ngada (2008) highlighted that the availability of professionally trained and qualified teachers mostly determines the success or failure of any educational program. Darling-Hammond (2000) reports that certification in teacher's preparation are one of the strong indicators of their student's success in reading. Similarly, Sanders (2000) is also of the opinion that professionally trained teacher is the only reason that affect student achievement. Bamidele and Adekola (2017) is of the view that that professional qualification is more important than academic qualification because professionally trained teacher has benefit of having pedagogical skills for teaching different courses.

However, some research studies found that teachers' professional qualification has no relationship or has negative relationship with students' academic achievements. Harris and Sass (2011) found that teachers' pre-service professional qualification or any other entrance exams marks had not related with students' academic achievement. Moss (2012) found no significant difference between students who were taught by professionally qualified or alternatively qualified on MCT2 math scores. Goldhaber (2000) also found no significant difference between the academic achievements of mathematics and science students who were taught by trained or untrained teachers. In a study, Betts, Zau and Rice (2003) found that teachers' professional qualification has negatively affected middle and high school students' achievement and found no

relationship with students' academic achievement of elementary school students.

However, lack of professional teachers is a threatening situation for a society, while it is far more disastrous to address situation by hiring untrained teachers. Many developing countries usually hire untrained teachers in elementary schools to address the shortage of professionally qualified teachers due to enrolment escalation and to minimize financial burden on the governments (Tanaka, 2012; Hussain, Ahmad, Asma, & Hakim, 2017). Schools around the globe, especially in developing world are more likely to fill vacancies with untrained teachers, substitutes teachers or hire teachers from other fields to meet community requirements. In many countries at the present, there is a serious lack of trained teachers for primary and secondary school (See, & Gorard, 2020).

In Pakistan, teachers' professional qualification has been addressed in all education policies since its inception. Subsequently, over the decades Teacher Professional Training institutes were established to develop human capital in term of professionally trained teachers. Public money has been invested and huge numbers of trained teachers were produced. In this context, in 2017 the provincial government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan announced teachers' recruitment policy and advertised different teachers' positions by eliminating professional qualification as pre-requisite for teaching at school level. Pre-service professional qualification was replaced by nine-month induction programme. The government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan through notification, No. SO(PE)4-5/SSRC/Meeting/2012/teacher Cadre/2017 amended the previous recruitment policy. The following table states the new recruitment policy for hiring teachers at school level.

**Table 1**  
*New Recruitment Policy of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa*

Eligibility	Age
(i) Second Class Master Degree or four (4) years BS Degree	21-35 years
(ii) nine months in service induction training	

This table shows that minimum pre-service professional qualification has been eliminated. In Pakistan teacher education departments exists in almost all major universities of Pakistan. They offer teacher education programs with the titles of B.Ed. (Bachelor of Education) and M.Ed. (Master of Education). Similarly, at provincial level

P.T.C (Primary Teaching Certificate), C.T (Certificate of Teaching) and Associated Degree in Education (ADE) were offered by Regional Institutes of Teacher Education in all provinces having competent staff and purpose-built buildings. These institutes have produced 0.7 million trained teachers. This shows that an appropriate infrastructure for teachers' professional development exists in Pakistan upon which the nation has spent its time and resources over the years. This led to the research question of the study that why Government of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa eliminated professional qualification from teacher's recruitment policy? This fascinated the researcher to conduct a study and analyze the current recruitment policy.

### **Methodology**

This qualitative study was archival in nature. The study analyzed Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan new recruitment policy by eliminating pre-service professional qualification as pre-requisite for recruiting teachers at school level. This decision has been analyzed on the basis of critical review of national education policies from *First all Pakistan National Conference 1947* to *National Education Policy 2017* and available literature in the field in a logical and sequential nature.

#### *Pakistan Educational Conference 1947*

The plan for developing teacher education in Pakistan begins from "All Pakistan Educational Conference 1947". The report of the conference conclusively added that to develop a strong nation, one must ensure trained, and highly paid teaching professional in the state. This conference recommended that it is the responsibility of the provinces to put their maximum efforts to prepare professionally qualified teachers for schools. The committee highlighted that a large number of teachers may be required to provide free and compulsory education to all the citizens of Pakistan (Salim, 2008). They suggested that short term courses may be introduced to train more teachers. The committee also shows its desire to establish research department in training institutes to study teacher's education related problems in Pakistan (Govt. of Pakistan, 1947). The committee on adult education recommended that proper planning may be carried out for professional development and recruitment of teacher in the first 5 years plan (Bengali, 1999). But there was severe shortage of professionally trained teachers and this shortage was filled by hiring untrained teachers (Behlol, Dad & Raja, 2014).

#### *National Commission on Education 1959*

Members of the commission in their report accepted the fact quality education is nested in the quality of its teachers who lead it. The commission has commented further that it's imperative to ensure the recruitment of highly trained, competent and enthusiastic teachers for all the levels of school with addition to ensures the social prestige of teachers among all professionals in the society. Furthermore, they also added that our education system needs academically competent enough in the subject that he/she taught along with sound pedagogical training, that is the art of teaching (Govt. of Pakistan,1960).

Competent teachers have been identified by the commission is the most important factor for success of any education system in any country. However, the Commission stated that hiring professionally qualified and competent teachers will be a major problem of schools in Pakistan. It emphasized that an effective and purposeful teacher training program was direly needed to encounter this problem (Saif, & Uddin, 2017). A minimum standard admission criterion for teachers training was also recommended by the commission as- teacher teaching to classes from I-V must possessed Secondary School Certificate (SSC), for teaching to VI to VIII classes a teacher must possess Higher Secondary School Certificate (HSSC) and for the teaching of grade IX and X he/she requires a Bachelor's Degree at least to be enrolled for different training programs. The total duration for the professional training of teachers teaching to Grade I-V was one year and fro Grade VI-VIII and IX-X was recommended two years along with a short course in the subject of teaching methods (Government of Pakistan, 1959). It also recommended that the curriculum of these training programs should be focused on developing teachers' grip of content knowledge and it should also be focused on teachers' knowledge of child psychology and teaching methodologies.

This report has been considered the most comprehensive policy document on teacher education policy in Pakistan by Bengali (1999) who is of the view that the document covers all the related areas to teacher education. He also declared implementation is the grim area of this document.

#### *Education Policy 1972*

The Education Policy 1972 stated that the proposed education programs will not be effectively initiated unless the preparation of qualified teachers. The policy further stated that "to ensure the preparation of sufficient number of teachers to all the levels of education, governmental financing and facilitation will be extended for the re-

organization of teacher education programme”. Innovative techniques will be introduced to overcome issues of non-availability of professionally trained teachers and other problems related to teachers’ motivation like recruitment, grades and pay (Zia, 2007). The policy highlighted that teacher training courses were out dated. These courses needed to be updated according to current technological advancement. The policy also proposed that to improve the professional qualifications of teachers and make them effective in their field, in-service training may be arranged on regular intervals (Government of Pakistan, 1972).

The policy makers realized the non-availability of professionally trained teachers and proposed that 2, 35,000 teachers may be required in the next five years to overcome this shortage. To cater the issue of non-availability of professionally trained teachers the policy recommended that teacher education may be taught as an elective subject at all levels including secondary, intermediate and Bachelor. The person studied this subject at any level will be eligible to be recruited as a teacher and will teach to primary, middle and secondary classes (Behlol, Dad & Raja, 2014).

#### *National Education Policy 1979*

The National Education Policy 1979 calls “*teacher is the pivot of the entire educational system*” and has suggested that serious measures were needed to strengthen teacher education by focusing on quality. The policy stated that in previous education policies the main focus was the quantitative expansion of pre-service teachers due to which a large number of PTC, CT and B.Ed. teachers were unemployed and proposed that shift will be made from quantity to quality by giving more emphasize on the enhancement of teacher education programs (Govt. of Pakistan, 1979). In this regard the first step was the upgradation of all teachers training institutions to college level throughout Pakistan. Another strong recommendation of the policy was that all in-service teachers must attend in-service training once at least in every five years, that will ensure the smooth professional development of in-service teachers.

#### *National Education Policy 1992*

The National Education Policy (1992) stated that the most important indicators of teachers closely related to the teaching learning process includes knowledge of subject matter, academic and professional qualification, competence and skills in teaching and professional commitment of teachers. The Policy highlighted that numerous steps were required to improve quality of teacher education in Pakistan. The policy

proposed that each federating unit shall setup teacher training institute. It also proposed to provide trainings to all the faculty of mobile training institution to strengthen their knowledge and skills. The policy recommended launching regular in-service training program for all teachers at all levels (Govt. of Pakistan, 1992). Pre-service teacher professional qualification was pre-requisite for recruitment of primary, middle and secondary schools' teachers. In order to provide enough trained main power to teaching profession numerous actions were taken. The policy also estimated around 65000 teachers with different qualification was unemployed.

#### *National Education Policy 1998*

This policy explained that quality of education has close relationship with classroom teaching, as teachers are the major stakeholders in the implementation of all educational reforms for which teachers' academic and professional qualification along with the professional commitment and competence are utmost important (Govt. of Pakistan, 1998).

National Education Policy 1998 gave significant recommendations related to teacher education in Pakistan. It recommended that school teachers' recruitment shall be merit based and transparent. It also recommended that the existing in-service training programme may be revised and revamp to improve the quality of teachers. They policy further recommended that academic qualification to enter teaching profession shall be raised gradually. It proposed that that minimum qualification for primary school teachers shall be raised to Higher Secondary School certificate. It also proposed that a new Diploma course (10+3) shall be launched for elementary school teacher. They recommended that that existing pre-service teachers training shall be revised thoroughly by improving and updating the existing curricula. It also recommended that the existing textbooks taught in teacher education programme shall be revised and improved. (Govt. of Pakistan, 1998).

The education policy 1998 was focused to improve teacher education and quality of teaching in our schools but being a signatory of Dakar framework of Education for all (EFA) and Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) deficient to provide a framework to fulfill its international commitments (Majoka & Khan, 2017).

#### *National Education Policy 2009*

The National Education Policy (2009) showed its commitment to reform teacher education and improves quality of teaching in schools. This

policy highlighted that *“the quality of teachers in the public sector is unsatisfactory. Poor quality of teacher in the system in a large number is owed to mutations in governance”*, they also pointed out that the current pre-service training program was obsolete and current in-service training is not enough.

The policy recommended that all areas of education need to be reformed that include pre-service training program and professional qualification needs to be standardized. It further stated that measure shall be taken for professional development of teachers and teaching workforce needs to properly manage. The policy also noted that the growth of private sector in providing teacher education is adding new complication to the teaching profession (Govt. of Pakistan, 2009).

The National Education Policy (2009) recommended that *“Bachelor degree with B.Ed. as a minimum requirement for teaching at the elementary level, and a Master’s Degree with B.Ed./M.Ed. for the Secondary level shall be ensured by 2018”*. It also recommended that the current one-year diploma courses Primary Teaching Certificate (P.T.C) and Certificate of Teaching (C.T) shall be phased out and teachers who hold these diplomas will be encouraged to improve their qualification. The policy suggested that eligibility criteria may be relaxed for less developed area of the country where teachers with relevant qualification are not available to overcome the shortage of professionally trained teachers. The policy recommended the national professional standards for teacher need to standardized, National Accreditation council for teacher education (NEACTE) shall be strengthen to standardized teacher education in Pakistan (Khan & Ahmad, 2018).

#### *National Education Policy 2017*

The main policy guidelines in National Education Policy (2017) were that teacher education should be guided by demand and teachers’ qualifications, pay structure and professional growth should be prioritized. This policy also emphasized the importance of establishment of criteria for professional accreditation and connecting the curriculum to the criteria, improvement of the quality of teaching staff and continued teacher professional development.

The objectives of National education policy (2017) for quality education was *“to prepare qualified, competent, committed and quality-conscious teachers, educational managers, leaders and teacher educators who may promote among learners the cognitive skills and dispositions required for developing a sustainably developing society”*. The policy purposed that to produce professionally trained teacher with knowledge of



subject matter they will be teaching. The policy also aims to establish minimum pre-service teacher training qualification for hiring school teachers in public and private schools.

The following table briefly described the pre-service professional qualification for recruitment of teachers at school level in all the education policies documents from All Pakistan first conference on education to National Education policy 2017.

**Table 2**

*Pre-service professional qualification for recruitment of teachers at school level in education policies documents (1947-2017) of Pakistan*

Education policies	Recommended pre-service professional qualification for recruitment of teachers at school level
Pakistan Educational Conference 1947	Properly trained teachers
National Commission on Education 1959	One-year pre-service qualification for the teachers of classes one to 5 <sup>th</sup> , Two years for the teachers of classes 6 <sup>th</sup> to 8 <sup>th</sup> , two years for the teachers of classes 9 <sup>th</sup> and 10 <sup>th</sup> with short courses in teaching methodology
Education Policy 1972	Pre-service professional qualification with in-service training on regular intervals
National Education Policy 1979	Pre-service professional qualification with in-service training course in every five years
National Education Policy 1992	Pre-service teacher professional qualification as pre-requisite for recruitment of primary, middle and secondary schools' teachers
National Education Policy 1998	Pre-service professional qualification with up gradation of academic qualification

National Education Policy 2009	Bachelor degree with B.Ed. for teaching at primary level and Master degree with B.Ed. for teaching at Secondary level
National Education Policy 2017	Intermediate with PTC or ADE for teaching at elementary level. Bachelor degree with CT or ADE for teaching at primary level and Master degree in Subject with Bed for secondary school teacher

This table shows that all education policies of Pakistan recommended that professionally trained teachers with pre-service professional qualification may be hired for teaching at school level.

Education is a provincial subject and all the hiring authorities of school teachers lie with the federating units of the country. However, National education policy provides guidelines and eligibility criteria for recruiting teachers at any level. The following table briefly outlines province wise eligibility criteria for hiring teachers at school level.

**Table 3**  
*School Teacher Employment Policies Province-wise*

Province	Level of Teacher	Required Qualification		Grade/BPS
		Academic	Professional	
Punjab	Elementary School Educator (ESE)	BA/B.Sc./BS(Hons)	BED (one year)/MED/MA Edu	9
		BSED/ADE/)/ BE (Hons) D		
	ESE Math / Science	BA/B.Sc. Two relevant subjects	BED (one year)/MED/MA Edu	9
	Senior Elem. School Educator (Subject)	Bachelor with two relevant subjects/ Conventional Master in the subject	B.Ed. (one year)/ MED/MA Edu.)	14

**Professional Qualification****Nasir, Nasir, Sajjad**

	Secondary School Teacher/Educator SSE (Subject)	Conventional Master degree in the subject	B.Ed./M.Ed./M.A. Edu	16
Sindh	Primary School Teacher	Intermediate	Nil	9
	Junior School Teacher (Science and General)	Graduate (BA/ BSc)	Nil	14
	High School Teacher (Science & General)	Master degree in Science/Arts/Humanities	Bed	15
KPK	Primary School Teacher	Intermediate	PTC/ Diploma in Education/ADE	12
	Elementary School Teacher	Bachelor degree	CT/Dip. In Education/ ADE	15
	Secondary School Teacher	Master degree in The Subject	Bed	16
Baluchistan	Junior Vernacular Teacher (JVT)	Matric	PTC (TadribulMalimeen for Arabic teacher)	7
	Junior English Teacher (JET)/ subject/ technical teacher	Intermediate	CT/ ADE/ One-year Agri. diploma For Technical	9
	SST	BA/BSc	Bed	16

Source: National Education policy of Pakistan 2017

The above table illustrate that the required qualification for different level at school. The minimum requirement for primary school teacher was intermediate with PTC/ Diploma in Education/ADE, elementary school teacher was Bachelor degree with CT/ Diploma in Education/ADE and for Secondary School Teacher was Mater Degree with Bed. It is evident that professional qualification was mandatory requirement for job at any level in schools.

This study found that all the national education policies of Pakistan highlighted the importance of pre-service professional

qualification and content knowledge as key factors for quality education and recommended a mandatory pre-service professional qualification for recruiting teachers at school level. Some previous education policies also recommended In-service trainings at regular interval. However, in early education policies the qualification for hiring school teacher were relaxed due to the non-availability of professionally trained teachers and untrained teachers were hired in order to overcome the shortage in less developed areas. The current recruitment policy eliminates pre-service professional qualification as pre-requisite for recruiting teachers at school level. Although this policy proposed a mandatory nine-month in-service training for newly hired school teachers, which may be helpful but cannot replace professional pre-service training programs.

The study concluded that the current teacher recruitment policy was not in line with any of all the previous national education policies of Pakistan as well as with National Education Policy 2017.

### **Recommendations**

In light of the above discussion it is recommended that the current recruitment policy adopted by the provincial government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa need be revised by adding professional qualification as pre-requisite to teaching job at school level. Furthermore, it is important to mention the government may invest their energies in the improvement of the current teachers' professional qualification by implementing strong monitoring mechanisms on the teachers' professional educational institutions in the form of teacher licensing, integration of ICT into the teacher education programs and the recruitment test from an external testing agency. It is also worthwhile to mention that currently in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa there is no scarcity of professionally qualified teachers, therefore, it is recommended that government may priorities them in the recruitment process at school level, as they have positive attitude towards teaching profession as compared to non-qualified teachers.

This study was qualitative in nature and delimited to document analysis only, it is further recommended that quantitative studies may also be carried out to analyze the perceptions of the stakeholders.

### **References**

- Akinsolu, A. O. (2010). Teachers and Students' Academic Performance in Nigerian Secondary Schools: Implications for Planning. *Florida Journal of Educational Administration & Policy*, 3(2), 86-103.

- Bamidele, A. D., & Adekola, F. F. (2017). Effects of Teacher's Qualifications and Teaching Experience on Students' Academic Achievement in Basic Science in Junior Secondary School. *International Journal of Education and Evaluation*, 3(2), 1-9.
- Behlol, M. G., Dad, H., & Raja, S. A. (2014). Educational Policies Syndrome: Teacher Education Programmes and Teacher Recruitment Practices in Pakistan. *Journal of Research in Social Sciences*, 1(1), 52-58.
- Bengali, K. (1999). History of educational policy making and planning in Pakistan. Islamabad: Sustainable Development Policy Institute.
- Betts, J. R., Zau, A., & Rice, L. (2003). Determinants of student achievement: New evidence from San Diego. San Francisco: Public Policy Institute of California.
- Bowe, J., & Gore, J. (2017). Reassembling teacher professional development: The case for quality teaching rounds. *Teachers and teaching*, 23(3), 352-366.
- Darling-Hammond, L. (1997). Doing what matters most: Investing in quality teaching. National Commission on Teaching & America's Future, Kutztown Distribution Center, 15076 Kutztown Road, PO Box 326, Kutztown, PA 19530-0326.
- Darling-Hammond, L. (2000). Teacher quality and student achievement. *Education policy analysis archives*, 8(1), 1-44.
- Eryilmaz, A., & Laslan, H. (1999). Determining and evaluating ideal physics teacher's characteristics. *Hacettepe Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 16(16), 53-60.
- Gore, J., Lloyd, A., Smith, M., Bowe, J., Ellis, H., & Lubans, D. (2017). Effects of professional development on the quality of teaching: Results from a randomised controlled trial of Quality Teaching Rounds. *Teaching and teacher education*, 68, 99-113.
- Govt of Pakistan. (1947). Proceeding of the Pakistan Education Conference. Karachi, Ministry of Interior, Education Division.
- Govt of Pakistan. (1960). Report of the Commission on National Education 1959. Karachi, Ministry of Education.
- Govt of Pakistan. (1972). The Education Policy 1972-80. Islamabad, Ministry of Education.
- Govt of Pakistan. (1979). National Education Policy 1978 and Implementation Programme, Islamabad, Ministry of Education.
- Govt of Pakistan. (1992). National Education Policy 1992. Islamabad, Ministry of Education.
- Govt of Pakistan. (1998). National Education Policy 1998-2010. Islamabad, Ministry of Education.

- Govt of Pakistan. (2009). National education policy 2009. Islamabad, Ministry of Education.
- Govt of Pakistan. (2017). National education policy 2017. Islamabad. Ministry of Education.
- Harris, D. N., & Sass, T. R. (2011). Teacher training, teacher quality and student achievement. *Journal of public economics*, 95(7-8), 798-812.
- Henard, F., & Roseveare, D. (2012). Fostering quality teaching in higher education: Policies and practices. An IMHE Guide for Higher Education Institutions, 7-11.
- Hightower, A. M., Delgado, R. C., Lloyd, S. C., Wittenstein, R., Sellers, K., & Swanson, C. B. (2011). Improving student learning by supporting quality teaching. Retrieved December 8, 2021, from <https://www.edweek.org/research-center/research-center-reports/improving-student-learning-by-supporting-quality-teaching-key-issues-effective-strategies>.
- Hussain, S., Ahmad, N., & Khan, F. N. (2013). The Effects Of Authentic Pedagogical Practices On Students' Educational Performances and Retention Power. *Pakistan Journal of Education* , 30 (II), 47-62.
- Hussain, S. Ahmad, N., Asma, Hakim, F, (2017). An Investigation of Teaching Methodologies and Disciplinary Problems in Overcrowded Classrooms. *Haripur Journal of Educational Research*, 1(1), 53-62.
- Ibrahim, A. (2000). Evaluating the pedagogical competence of junior secondary school Integrated Science. In Teachers' 40th STAN Annual Conference Proceedings. 138-142.
- Khan, F. N., & Ahmad, N. (2018) Islamic Perspective of National Accreditation Council for Teacher Education (NACTE) and Problems to NACTE in Ensuring Quality Teacher Education. *Sir Syed Journal of Education & Social Research (SJESR)*, 1(1), 59-76
- Majoka, M. I., & Khan, M. I. (2017). Education policy provisions and objectives. A review of Pakistani education policies. *Italian Journal of Sociology of Education*, 9(2), 104-125.
- McCaffrey, D. F., Lockwood, J. R., Koretz, D. M., & Hamilton, L. S. (2003). Evaluating Value-Added Models for Teacher Accountability. Monograph. RAND Corporation. Santa Monica.
- Moss, P. L. (2012). Teacher certification and student achievement (Unpublished Doctoral dissertation), The University of Southern Mississippi.

- Munir, N., Ahmad, N., Hussain, S., & Ghani, U. (2018). Relationship of learning styles and academic performance of secondary school students. *Rawal Medical Journal*, 43(3), 421-424.
- Ngada, A. J. (2008). Impact of NCE programme on preparation and performance of nce graduate teachers in Borno state Junior Secondary Schools. *Research in Curriculum*, 5(1), 190-195
- Oluremi, O.F. (2013). Enhancing educational effectiveness in Nigeria through teacher's professional development. *European Scientific Journal*, 9(28), 422-431.
- Saif, P., & Uddin, J. (2017). A Comparative Study of Subject Knowledge of B. Ed Graduates of Formal and Non-Formal Teacher Education Systems. *Journal of Education and Educational Development*, 4(2), 270-283.
- Sanders, W. L. (2000). Value-added assessment from student achievement data: opportunities and hurdles. *Journal of personnel evaluation in education*, 14(4), 329-339.
- Schacter, J., & Thum, Y. M. (2004). Paying for high-and low-quality teaching. *Economics of Education Review*, 23(4), 411-430.
- See, B. H., & Gorard, S. (2020). Why don't we have enough teachers? A reconsideration of the available evidence. *Research Papers in Education*, 35(4), 416-442.
- Shaheen, N., Ahmad, N., & Shah, R. (2020). Quality University Education Through Conducive Classroom Learning Environment. *Research Journal of Social Sciences & Economics Review*, 1(1), 76-84.
- Sofo, S., Thompson, E., & Kanton, T. L. (2019). Prospects and Challenges of Upgrading Untrained Teachers in Sub-Saharan Africa: The Case of Ghana. In *FIRE: Forum for International Research in Education*, 5(2), 120-137.
- Zia, R. (2007). Values, ethics and teacher education: A perspective from Pakistan. *Higher Education Management and Policy*, 19(3), 1-21.