

## **Politics of Education Policies in Pakistan: A Comparative Analysis of General Zia Ul Haq and General Pervaiz Musharraf Eras**

Gultaj Ali Bangash<sup>\*</sup>, †Ahsan Ur Rehman, Hanif Ullah Khan<sup>‡</sup>

### **Abstract**

*Reflecting on the revivalist and realist approaches toward Islamization and modernity, this research study aims at exploring the socio-political context of education policies and reform enacted on the paradigm of Islamization and Enlightened Moderation in Pakistan. The study is carried out through the lens of culturally relevant advocacy and social justice theory. Qualitative research method is being undertaken using a social constructivist perspective. Document analysis technique is employed to evaluate policy text from the Gen: Zia ul Haq and Gen: Musharraf regimes. The main data for this study is the manuscripts of National Education Policy 1979 and National Education Policy 2009. The study argues how politically contesting ideologies negotiated each other in both eras. The study also discovers the internal and external political pressures that caused subsequent educational reforms. The study concludes that the politics of ideological contestation has adversely affected the education system, therefore to build a solid education system, education policymaking must be freed from contesting politics.*

**Keywords:** islamization, globalization, moderation, ideology, politics, educational reforms

### **Introduction**

Pakistan's education system has seen several changes and transformations owing to the country's ongoing economic and structural growth and persistent political transitions (Iqbal, 2011). Pakistan has adopted several educational plans since its inception; however, the vision, objective, and purpose of the national education system are framed through dominant political ideology (Aly, 2007). Furthermore, ideological contention among Islamists and seculars has crippled the policy-making process in the country. Likewise, political, economic and strategic factors in and around the country have also affected the vision and aim of education in Pakistan.

---

<sup>\*</sup> PhD Scholar (Education), Qurtuba University of Science and Information Technology, Peshawar, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

<sup>†</sup> Subject Specialist, at Department of Elementary and Secondary Education, Peshawar, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

<sup>‡</sup> Assistant Professor, at Education Department, Qurtuba University of Science and Information Technology, Peshawar, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

### **Purpose of the Study**

The purpose of the study is to understand the role of politics in education policymaking in Pakistan. Though politics came into action right from the beginning after partition in 1947 and never ended till date. In the history of education policymaking, the most profound, prominent and ideologically opposing policy shift was noticed in Gen: Zia ul Haq and Gen: Musharraf era. This is the main reason for which Gen: Zia and Gen: Musharraf's eras were selected for the study. Coincidentally, both were military dictators with conflicting political motives behind their urge of power. Both faced different geo-political, economic and strategic challenges and responded differently. In order to study Islamists and seculars' ideological antagonism in the country, the era of Gen: Zia and Gen: Musharraf provide rich content to the researchers. Gen: Zia ul Haq introduced Islamization and Gen: Pervaiz Musharraf was in favor of Western-sponsored Enlightened Moderation. Both faced different internal and external political pressures and the ideology they possess is in response to these pressures. Internal political pressures e.g. regional, ethnic and religious and external political pressures e.g. conditional foreign aid from US, UN agencies, Western Countries, and Gulf States have put significant impact on rulers' choices. The reforms introduced by both military dictators are based on their ideological positioning. Therefore, the study of politics of education helps to understand the actual reasons behind the educational reforms introduced by them.

### **Background of the Study**

Political unrest in Pakistan has hampered educational policymaking. Policy conflicts have plagued the education system (Nayyar & Salim, 2005). Several educational policies have been proposed but never implemented. The structure of Pakistan's education system has seen several modifications and transformations as a result of the country's ongoing economic and structural growth, expansion, and persistent political changes (Iqbal, 2011). Following East Pakistan's separation in 1971, education was used as a tool to reform and reconstruct education in the rest of the country (Nayyar & Salim, 2005). After that, in 1977, Gen: Zia ul Haq took control and envisioned for the Islamization of society. Nawaz Sharif's two-term government pursued much the same agenda. Gen Musharraf, on the other side, rejected Gen Zia's Islamization ideology and introduced the concept of "Enlightened Moderation" (Iqbal, 2011).

In Pakistan's history, the hegemonic conflict between Islamization and secular elites is evident (Iqbal, 2011). Politically, Gen: Zia ul Haq was positioned at a period when the desire for Islamization escalated due to

three internal and external political factors. First was related to internal politics where the Nizam e Mustafa moment (a coalition of Islamist political parties) arose in opposition to Bhutto's Islamic socialist ideology and to seek the integration of Islamic doctrine in governmental affairs (Siddique, 2016). Secondly, Islamic revolutionary moments around the world like Iran and Egypt have ignited the flame of Islamic dominance. Thirdly, in 1979, in an effort to halt Soviet Union expansion in the area, the United States proposed activating an Islamic Jihadi force to oppose the Russian invasion of Afghanistan. These internal and external political events have paved the way for Pakistan's Islamization (Lall, 2010). In the backdrop of the aforementioned political circumstances, General Zia ul Haq used Islamization to legitimize his reign. In contrast to this perception, Islamists see him as a real believer in Islam who consciously Islamized the state institutions to overcome the society's secular inclinations. Gen: Musharraf, on the other hand, introduced the term 'enlightened moderation' to combat extremist elements of society, which he taught were the legacy of Gen: Zia's Islamization (Lall, 2010; Ahmad, 2009). After September 11, 2001 terrorist attacks, Gen: Musharraf chose to be an important partner of United States in the 2001 Afghan War. United States considered madrassahs as origin of terrorism. During Gen: Zia ul Haq tenure, these madrassahs were used to institutionalize extremist groups for the US-led 'Jihad' against the Soviet Union. Education Sector Reform Assistance (ESRA), which was intended to focus on educational policy concerns such as curriculum revision and madrassah regulations, provided around \$75 million to help Pakistan's educational reforms (Lall, 2010).

Despite the fact that Gen: Musharraf received a great deal of backing from the United States and Western nations to de-Islamize the country's education system, he encountered fierce opposition. Gen: Musharraf had to find a balance between the growing American influence and the Islamist pressure against de-Islamization efforts. This contention was visible during Gen: Musharraf's rule (1999-2007). However, Gen: Musharraf managed to implement significant reforms in the educational system and transform ideological orientation from Islamization to enlightened modernization (Lall, 2010).

The National Education Policy 2009 thought process began in 2005. Following multiple debates and workshops, a White Paper was prepared in 2007, which served as the foundation for the National Education Policy 2009. This policy was developed over the course of several consultation workshops and debates. In 2008 Gen: Musharraf's government ended and the charge was handed over to Pakistan People Party after the general election. In 2009, the civilian government's cabinet announced the education policy after making slight changes (Iqbal, 2011;

Siddiqui, 2016). The White Paper outlined the reasons and provided explanations and justifications for subsequent policy reforms.

### **Objective and Research Question of the Study**

The aim and objective of this inquiry is to explore the role of politics in education policymaking in Pakistan. Based on the research objective, the study is carried out to answer the following research questions;

Q1. What is the role of politics in education policymaking in Pakistan?

Q2. How politics have affected the educational reforms in Pakistan?

The main data of this research was educational policies of Gen: Zia ul Haq and Gen: Pervaiz Musharraf. Document analysis strategy was applied to analyze policy text of 1979 and 2009 education policies. The content regarding ideology and justification of policy decisions are rich in both policies. To unpack the dynamics of Islamization and enlightened moderation, analysis of the policy document is integral to understand the intentions, tendencies, and objectives of policymakers. According to Anderson and Holloway (2020) policy is not only text rather it also includes ideologies, discourses, processes, and strategies, thus the complexity of policy documents should not be overlooked.

### **Significance of the Study**

The current study is distinct from others in the field because i) the study is undertaken from a qualitative perspective, as most of studies in this field are quantitative in nature; ii) beside scholarly work, these studies are based on the researchers' preexisting ideological commitments and hence cannot be trusted as objective accounts of the situation.

According to the literature, the issue of ideology is described and presented from either left or right perspective, making it difficult for an impartial reader to grasp "what actually went wrong with education". To define and comprehend the ideological foundations of the reforms enacted by both General Zia's Islamization and General Musharraf's Enlightened Moderation, in-depth research with a neutral stance is required. It might be challenging for a researcher to maintain objectivity when investigating contentious ideological matters. The researchers made an effort to remain objective on the verge of contending ideologies through advocacy of education itself. Both of these competing ideologies had their chances to dominate in the education policy arena, but the fundamental issue of "what

went wrong with education?" remains unresolved (Ahmad, 2021). The research was undertaken with the intention to contribute to the already lack of literature through an objective analysis of recent developments in the field of education. The study uses document analysis approach to analyze educational policies of Gen: Zia ul Haq and Gen: Pervaiz Musharraf and subsequently understand the reforms proposed by them. Within the frameworks of Islamization and Enlightened Moderation, the research analyzed the intellectual underpinnings of both approaches. The study was conducted to understand these ideological contestations through historical, socio-political and global perspectives. The impact of these ideologies was investigated in reforms made in the field of curriculum, Madrassah and language. The findings of this research will enlighten policymakers and other stakeholders to strengthen education and its institutions, instead of being used as a pawn by the far left or far right.

### **Islamization**

Islamization is a political concept that entails reforming the constitutional, economic, and judicial system in conformity with the entirety of true Islamic practices. This is considered as revolutionary strategy to Islamize society through state power. Fuller (2003) refers to it as a revival of Muslim identity and a potential identity politics development. Islamization has a long history in Pakistan, dating back to its inception; nevertheless, it primarily became a government policy under Gen: Zia ul Haqq's tenure from 1977 to 1988. For the objective of enforcing Nizam e Mustafa, Gen. Zia ul Haq formed an Islamic state and implemented Shariah Law. Based on his Islamization push, he also attempted to Islamize the country's educational system.

### **Enlightened Moderation**

General Pervez Musharraf coined the term "Enlightened Moderation"; it refers to the notion of moderate Islam as opposite to fundamentalist Islam. Enlightened moderation has challenged the conventional version of Islam and criticized the prevailing understanding of established concepts. This ideology is sometimes characterized as a modern interpretation of Islam and lays claim to its own canon of core beliefs. Inspired by secular beliefs, this ideology emphasizes on social justice, Human rights, gender disparity, equity and economic well-being.

### **Literature Review: Theoretical Framework**

James N. Rosenau (1999) first introduced the concept of Sphere of Authority (SoA) in his article "Toward an Ontology for Global Governance". According to him, the traditional global geographical divide

has evolved into several Spheres of Authority (SoA). According to this notion, several players share power with local governments; the authority of each actor is determined by relationships with the other actor surrounding it. The jurisdiction of states is shared by various "sub-national" (local organizations, NGOs) and "Supra-national" (International agencies and states) entities. Thus, Sphere of Authority SoA signifies that multiple governments and global organizations negotiate and share policy space (Rosenau, 2000).

Globalization has redefined the concept of governance, thus the role of the state in the policy domain has shrunk (Rosenau, 1999). Each actor in the Sphere of Authority SoA strives to increase its power, forcing others' authority to decrease. This expansion and contraction relocate the role of different actors in policy domain (see Figure 1). This relative authority embodies the complicated dynamics of the relationship between nation-states and global governance (Kim, 2020). Similarly, authority shifts at all levels of governance as a result of globalization can be analyzed by using this phenomenon. Rosenau (2000) argues that, despite the fact that globalization has altered the dynamics of the state's political power, policy formulation is still a state function; yet, local and international players participate in policymaking. Therefore, this multilayered form of governance produced by globalization has made the enterprise of policy analysis more difficult (Deacon, 1997).

This interwoven complex nature of policy articulation can be disentangled and analyzed through critical study of the policy text. In addition, document analysis of the policy text may be used to learn, through the policy's language, the involvement of both domestic and foreign players in national policymaking. Robinson (2008) elaborates further on the complicated structure of state power, arguing that the state may exert more control over other national and international players in one matter and less control in another; this complexity has rendered the state a "hybrid state". Due to its hybrid nature, it may be concluded that the nation-state is neither wholly controlled by global forces nor entirely autonomous in national matters.



Figure 1

### Constellation of SoA around Nation State

This model was produced by James N. Rosenau in 1999, summarizing the concept of Global Governance and Sphere of Authority in Global Space. From: "Toward an Ontology for Global Governance" by James N. Rosenau (1999). In M. Hewson, & T. Sinclair (Eds.), *Approaches to Global Governance Theory* (pp. 287-301). State University of New York Press, Albany.

The dependency through globalization has not only resulted in economic imbalance rather political, cultural, intellectual, and technological influences are also resulted by shared hostility among rich and poor nations. In this imbalanced relationship, wealthy nations control the process, resulting in injustice, inhumanity, and violation of international law. Various critics of globalization have elucidated these crucial aspects in depth (see, Mazrui, 2002; Apple, 2004; Biraimah et al, 2008). Hence, the objective formulation in policy is a joint venture of national as well as global actors. In educational policy analysis, this framework helps to understand policy objectives formulations and identify possible reasons against reforms proposed in the policy text.

### Methodology

The purpose of a study defines the research methodology and design. The objective of this inquiry is to explore the role of politics in education policymaking in Pakistan. For this purpose, qualitative data

analysis method was used for exploring educational policies. To explore the answers of the aim of this study, social constructivist interpretive paradigm was deemed being suitable. The current study is inspired by theoretical framework of Sphere of Authority SoA by James N. Rosenau (1999). According to him, the traditional global geographical divide has evolved into several Spheres of Authority (SoA). Therefore, this multilayered form of governance has made the enterprise of policy analysis more difficult to understand. Education policies of Gen: Zia ul Haq and Gen: Musharraf are the main source of data for analysis. Policy documents are social artifacts of collaborative, coordinated activity, not just content containers (Prior, 2003). Atkinson and Coffey (1997) argue that documentary data are social truths and evidences, they are generated, disseminated, and utilized in organized fashion. Since these documents are the reflection of specific social, cultural and political structures, therefore, the analysis of these documents needs wider understanding of its context or "those elements that are physically present," but also on the merit of their latent content, or "an interpretive reading of the symbolism underlying the physical data" (Berg, 2001). Due to the complex nature of policy documents qualitative data analysis method was considered appropriate analysis methodology.

For the understanding of the dynamics of Islamization and Enlightened Moderation, this paper draws on policy analysis of National Education Policy 1979 and National Education Policy 2009 during Gen: Zia and Gen: Musharraf era respectively. For this purpose, document analysis strategy was considered vital to understand policymakers' intentions, tendencies, and objectives. This method allowed us to comprehend the ideological conflict between Islamization and Enlightened Moderation in Pakistan's education policy and reforms. The policy is not only text rather it also includes ideologies, discourses, processes and strategies; thus, the complexity of policy documents should also be considered (Anderson & Holloway, 2020). Research data was taken from the statements of both policies. Both policies are found rich in content to answer the research question of this research. The research is empirical in the sense that the pattern of policy analysis observations was collected as it is.

### **Document Analysis**

Documents are empirical evidences (Corbin & Strauss, 2008), and are grouped into two main categories: formal and informal. Formal documents (publications, public comments, newsletters etc.) which show the official policy regarding an issue of national importance. The national education policies are the part of formal documents that are the subject of



analysis for this study. Therefore, they need careful analysis for precision, coverage, and theory-building (Prior, 2012; Yin, 2009).

The documents were analyzed by the combination of content and thematic analysis techniques, where sampling, coding, categories formation, theme constructing and interpretation was conducted (Krippendorff, 2013). In this research, the documents under study were National Education Policy 1979 and National Education Policy 2009. These official documents served as primary source materials and were legitimate documents accessible to researchers and the general public. The researchers made reflexive movements between different phases of analysis from coding to themes formation and finally to interpretation.

Similarly, thematic analysis was also used. It is a technique for identifying, analyzing, and interpretation of categories and themes (Braun & Clarke, 2006). Following the recommendation of Braun and Clarke (2006), we followed a six-phase procedure to identify established, significant patterns: familiarization with the text, eliciting code, then forming categories and defining main themes and finally reporting them.

### **Findings**

During the study six overarching themes emerged: i) Ideology and Vision (statements that describe Islamization and Enlightened Moderation); ii) Citizenship (based on ideology, what type of citizen both policies have acquired); iii) Education System (How both policies have defined Education, and what type of education system both policies have considered appropriate); iv) Curriculum reforms; v) Language reforms and vi) Madrassah reforms. The details of the findings are discussed below:

#### **Ideology and Vision**

In this theme, statements that describe Islamization and Enlightened Moderation are highlighted. Both policies are based on certain ideologies and justified their ideological stance. Ideology provides the guideline to describe the role of education in society. In this theme we will analysis that how each describes the meaning of education.

#### **Islamization**

The National Education Policy of 1979 attempted to align the education system with the ideology of Islam and Pakistan. While describing the ideological foundation, the National Education Policy, 1979 stated as:

“Harmonization of education in Pakistan with the concept of Islam and ideology of Pakistan necessitates adoption of a truly National Education Policy” (NEP, 1979 p.1).”

The notion of Muslim nationhood "Ummah" was mentioned for the first time in National Education Policy 1979. This brings the concept of nationhood beyond territorial boundary of the country which is the essence of Islamization. The policy states: -

“To create awareness, in every student that he, as a member of Pakistani nation, is also a part of the universal Muslim Ummah and that it is expected of him to make a contribution towards the welfare of fellow Muslims inhabiting the globe on the one hand and to help spread the message of Islam throughout the world on the other” (NEP, 1979 p.1).

Similarly, the statements like, “aims of education should be consistent with our faith, national ideology and aspiration”; “loyalty to Islam”; “ideological identity”; “spreading the message of Islam throughout the world” and “Islamic state” are frequently used in the policy. This clearly shows the government’s intention toward Islamization.

### **Enlightened Moderation**

While elaborating on policy priorities the policy stated as:

“The foregoing articulations of the economic and social goals are taken by the Policy as an appropriate basis for defining the priorities for the National Educational Policy. They lead to two overarching priorities. Given the important role of education as a key driver of economic growth and social advancement, the first policy priority is to widen access to education for all. Improving the quality of education, particularly in its dimension of being relevant to the needs of the economy, becomes an equally important strategic priority

“Giving importance to economic and social goals, the national educational policy stressed the economic aspect of education by giving access to education to all.” (NEP, 2009 p12).

The National Education Policy of 2009 viewed education as a "Vital Investment" for human and economic growth, one that would be molded by society's growing social ideals. This Policy sought to reform education from a fundamentalist standpoint. Education was aimed to improve human life through development and mutual harmony.

Knowledge society, access to all, equity, international commitments, economic development, human development, socio-economic development, technology, social mobility, inclusive society, interfaith harmony, poverty, injustice, sustainable economic development, Human Development Index HDI, human-centered development, innovation, gender inequality, minority rights, democracy, welfare state, and other terms are frequently used in the policy. The extensive use of these words in policy text clearly confirms that this strategy was developed with a globalization perspective and is grounded in secular ideology. This study confirms the findings of Sajid Ali's point of view that developing countries are demanded to use global language and secular stance in education policies (Ali, 2016). The study further enhances our understanding that Pakistan has adopted the global agenda and for this, it has to incorporate the dominant nation's priorities into its education policy (Khushik & Diemer, 2018).

### **Citizenship**

The second theme of the study covers the statements regarding citizenship. Both policies have defined and explained the following questions based on their own ideological positionings. The questions like: What should be the characteristics of an individual; what type of individual or citizen is required, are answered in the policy text. In this theme, we tried to answer these questions.

In the National Education Policy of 1979, the government aimed to ensure that every citizen is aware of the Pakistan movement and remained loyal to Islamic State. The policy states that:

“To provide ideological sound, culturally proud and professional honest citizens.”

(NEP, 1979 p.1).

“To develop and inculcate in accordance with the Quran and Sunnah the character, conduct, and motivation expected of a true Muslim” (NEP, 1979 p.1).

Likewise, the policy emphasized in bringing awareness to fellow citizens the concept of Muslim Ummah and guide them to take part in the well-being of Muslims and promote Islam all around the world.

On the other hand, National Education policy 2009 intended a completely different type of citizen. On the type of citizen acquired through education, the policy aimed at

“To have the traits of self-reliance, and being a responsible member of society.” (NEP 2009 p.18).

The policy intends to make the individual "a global citizen" (NEP, 2009 p.11). It emphasized on designing educational input relevant to globalization.

Gen: Musharraf's education policy aimed to nurture a population free of religious fanaticism and more tolerant of diverse faiths and beliefs. According to Haqqani (2005), Gen: Zia ul Haq's policy was not inclusive in nature. Syed et al. (2016) and Aziz and Bukhari (2017) further underlined the uncertainty during the Zia era among minorities and other religions. In contrast, the use of terms such as tolerance, interfaith harmony, and minority rights in Gen: Musharraf's policy, clearly conveys the message of the secular school of thought. Islamists viewed this modification as an attempt to undercut Islamic principles and ultimately, strengthen secularism in society (Shah & Karamat, 2021).

### **Education Reforms**

The third theme covers the education system reforms implemented in both Gen: Zia and Gen: Musharraf eras. Gen: Zia ul Haq considered the formal education system of that time far from people's aspirations and Islamic values. During his tenure, a complete overhaul of the education system was sorely felt, for this reason, Islamization of all policies was undertaken by the government. Numerous reforms were introduced in the education system through the 1979 Education Policy. The policy outlined its own goals and objectives for the current educational system and held English-medium schools accountable for the abysmal quality of education in the nation. The policy stated as: -

“The existence of English medium schools is part of colonial legacy that does not match with the psychology of our culture, therefore, all such school have to adopt Urdu as a medium of instruction.” (NEP, 1979 p.59).

National Education Policy 1979 acknowledged the contribution of Madrasahs, Mosques, and Mohalla schools. Similarly, on criteria for teacher selection as new induction, the policy stated as: -

“Ideologically committed, with missionary zeal teachers will be selected who can work extra hour to teach in mosques.” (NEP, 1979 p.10).

In National Education Policy 2009, the emphasis was drawn on economic and social development. A vision for education was established

to maximize social and economic prospects for the young generation as summed up:

To instill the qualities of individual responsibility to society and to the ideology of Pakistan which is based on social justice, and cultural harmony within the limit's of 1973 constitution of Pakistan. (NEP, 2009 p.10).

### **Curriculum Reforms**

The fourth theme of the study covers curriculum reforms of both eras. National Education Policy 1979 considered Curriculum review and revision essential for the Islamization of education. The objective of the curriculum revisions was to align the current curriculum with Islam and the Ideology of Pakistan (NEP, 1979). The second objective of curriculum reform was to safeguard and maintain the Islamic ideology. According to Siddique (2016), the changes implemented during the tenure of Gen Zia were irreversible. The policy stated its aim for curriculum review and revision as:

“In order to ensure that Islamic ideology is protected, the concept of nationhood is properly reflected and high academic standards are maintained, the existing textbooks of all levels will be revised” (NEP, 1979 p.56).

It introduced number of reforms in the curriculum which included revision and review of all textbooks, asking English medium schools to take approval from authorities regarding textbooks studied in their schools, and Islamiyat (Islamic Studies) was made compulsory in schools, colleges, and universities.

The National Education Policy 2009 considered curriculum as outdated and extremist. In order to modify and modernize the existing curriculum, the policy stated as:

Curriculum formation will be students' learning outcome based; to reflect national character and the spirit of critical inquiry.”

(NEP, 2009 p.35-36).

Gen: Musharraf's Government was conscious of global concerns, and it has become one of the factors affecting the current education system. To address all the overarching demands of globalization e.g. minority rights, human rights and gender discrimination, the policy argued that the role of the curriculum should be to bring awareness in individuals to protect their rights.

Gen Musharraf soon after taking charge, aimed to reverse the curriculum reforms of Islamization, however, these efforts could not be materialized in full spirit. The changes made to the curriculum and texts were cosmetic, and no serious measures were taken to update the curriculum and eliminate extremist content (Afzal, 2016; Jamil, 2009). Hussain (2011) stated that the reform in the curriculum was initiated with the purpose of removing the word "Jihad" and other harsh terms used for other religions from the textbooks. Due to political pressure, the government has compromised on several issues, with negligible effect on the final outcome. The critical literature reveals that only Jihad-related writings were eliminated under the rule of Gen Musharraf, but the vast bulk of alterations made in the name of Islamization are still in place (Siddique, 2016; Afzal, 2018; Zaman, 2018; Hussain, 2011).

### **Madrassah Reforms**

According to the National Education Policy of 1979, the *Madrassah* education is the indigenous and primary educational network of the people of Pakistan, whereas the traditional education system is a remnant of British rule that runs counter to the ambitions and national requirements of the people. Secondly, the policy viewed *Madrassah* as deprived of government support, causing it to lag behind other educational institutions. In Gen: Zia ul Haq era, the institution of *madrassah* received official backing. As a result, Cohen (2004) observed that the number of *Madrassah* institutions has greatly expanded throughout his era. The current "*madaris*" have been bolstered by these financial aids from Saudi Arabia, causing opening of new *Madrassahs* and private institutions (Afzal, 2018). Zaman (2018) noted that despite the rise in these institutions, *Madrassah* students still lacked knowledge of contemporary history, science, and mathematics. This demonstrates that although the number of religious institutions increased significantly throughout the Gen: Zia ul Haq era, the standard of learning and outcomes remained the same.

The National Education Policy 2009 acknowledges *madrassah* and its historical significance and contributions to the field of education. However, according to the policy, *Madrassahs* have widened the "social gap" since the majority of graduates are untrained and unable to find employment. This feeling of exclusion from the national economy leads to their engagement in extremist activities. *Madrassah* curricula have been criticized since they are not subject to any kind of supervision or regulation by the government. Gen: Pervaiz Musharraf had a more westernized and contemporary perspective and perception of *Madrassah* education. The

government's intention can be seen clearly in the proposed reforms. The government viewed madrassas as a threat on the national and international levels following the events of 9/11. Consequently, it is obvious from the data that the government has opted to mitigate the harmful impacts of *madaris* and integrate them into the normal school system. Some of Gen: Musharraf's advisors, who were despairing about any progress in these antiquated and regressive institutions, recommended banning more radical and extremist madrassahs. The remaining madrassahs would be subject to government supervision and restrictions. Overall, enrolment in madrassahs was intended to decline (Cohen, 2004).

### **Language Reforms**

The government of Pakistan confronted two significant language issues in the past: regional languages vs Urdu and English versus Urdu. What should be the language of education is still a point of contention. Siddique (2016) claims that the government still lacks a documented official language policy. Urdu was recognized as an instructional language in the National Education Policy of 1979. The aim of doing this, according to the policy, is to reinforce the ideological foundation for unity, patriotism, and national cohesiveness (NEP, 1979 p.2). National Education Policy advocated the following medium of instruction-related initiatives; i) It acknowledged the status of regional languages at the preschool and primary school levels. ii) Urdu was regarded as the primary instructional medium in the educational system, and iii) the significance of English was recognized at the higher education level (NEP, 1979 p.61).

English-medium schools were required to choose between regional or Urdu as the medium of instruction at the primary level, beginning with class one from April 1979. English medium schools' textbooks other than English were asked to be replaced with Urdu or any provincial language. The opening of a new English-language school was prohibited. Due to the lack of Urdu-translated textbooks at higher education levels, the policy acknowledged unfeasibility of Urdu as an instructional medium. It was further decided to phase out the change in college-level textbooks in the first years and then, based on this experience, implement the plan in higher education disciplines. It was envisioned under the strategy that the obstacles to implementing Urdu as the medium of instruction would be gradually eliminated and Urdu would become the language of instruction at all levels (NEP, 1979).

The policy of 1979 also promoted Arabic language. It clarified that Arabic is rooted in Islamic teachings and is the language of the Quran and Hadith (NEP, 2009). Thus, it was aimed to enhance the students' Arabic language comprehension. Gulf countries have provided Pakistan with

substantial funding. Numerous measures were taken to strengthen Arabic language faculty and scholarly work at the university level.

Regarding language, the National Education Policy 2009 acknowledged the significance of English, National, and regional languages. The policy has acknowledged the value of regional languages for various rich cultures, Urdu for national cohesion and integration, and English for economic development (NEP, 2009 p.4). The government decided that all students take English from class I along with Urdu, mathematics, an integrated subject, and one regional language (NEP, 2009 p.20). For the first five years regarding the medium of instruction, the policy stated that:

For the next coming years, the federating units will have options to teach science and mathematics in their regional or national language but that has yet to be implanted”. (NEP, 2009 p.20).

The matter of language has been politicized by contending political ideological groups. The significance of the English language cannot be ignored, and its rejection will result in the deprivation of a significant number of students and the devaluation of the Pakistani passport internationally. However, this necessity should not be at the expense of regional and national languages. The overwhelming emphasis on English has pushed has sidelined Urdu and regional languages, therefore, students who are instructed in English are unable to read and write their local languages: a painful reality. This is due to the fact that pupils are introduced to the English language at a young age, and the majority of textbooks are also written in English. Urdu and local languages are in danger of extinction due to the government's lack of support and care.

### **Discussion**

Based on the analysis of the policy document, the findings clearly confirm that both policies have explicitly stated their aims and objectives and supported their particular ideologies and criticized the others. Gen Zia ul Haq and Gen Musharraf introduced distinct ideologies. However, they did not develop these ideologies on their own. Various internal and external political factors were involved in composition of these ideologies. Gen: Zia ul Haq Islamization drive was the first serious effort recorded in the history of Pakistan to Islamize state institutions. His political stance was supported by the masses as it was dire need of the time, however external political pressure of United States and Gulf countries to counter Russian invasion made a significant impact on policymaking. Gen: Zia managed to gain people's support as his intentions were aligned with genesis of the people of Pakistan. Gen: Musharraf Enlightened Moderation drive was in reaction to Gen: Zia's Islamization. The main push to this



drive was US led Western world pressure to limit Islamist elements in the country to counter terrorism and Taliban in Afghanistan and Pakistan. Gen: Musharraf moderation drive was imposed and against the people's cultural and religious sentiments, thus serious resistance was observed in state machinery and around the masses.

Gen: Zia ul Haq introduced Mosque and Mohalla schools and strengthen madrassah institution through reforms. He banned English medium schools and encouraged Urdu and Arabic languages. He revised the curriculum to include Islamic content in the textbooks. Islamiyat subject was made compulsory at all stages of education. Overall system of education was aimed to be Islamized in his tenure. Gen: Musharraf tried to counter Islamization and modernize the education system in line with globalization. He sought to remove what he taught extremist content from the textbooks and increase government control and supervision of madrassahs. He made English, compulsory subject from first class. The reforms made by Gen: Zia were more conventional and involved indigenous institutions to participate. Whereas, Gen: Musharraf's reforms were based on United States and international organizations' demands and involved NGO's to take part in national reconciliation.

### **Conclusion and Recommendations**

Based on the findings of the study, it is concluded that the role of politics in education policy formulation has been quite noticeable during Gen Zia and Gen Musharraf eras. Major changes and reforms enacted were mostly enforced through internal political pressures or imposed by external agencies. The historical legacy of educational policy-making in Pakistan also conforms to this polarization. The outcomes of the study are also consistent with Sajid Ali (2005) argument that due to globalization, neoliberal agenda promoted by international organizations has undermined the goals of education as a public good. Foreign aid-dependent countries like the one understudy have to negotiate among international agencies' demands and internal political pressures. This study recommends: i) depoliticize education policy-making from parliament interventions and bring it in the hands of education departments officials and experts, ii) Political approach must be transformed into professional approach in education policy-making, iii) socially just and democratic education policy is needed in Pakistan that takes into account local contexts and addresses issues of equity and quality. There are examples around the world that nations have advanced and met globalization challenges by keeping their regional, ethnic and religious identity intact (Zia, 2003). Education policy-making should be based on the cultural and economic realities of the state of Pakistan.

The study was limited to content analysis of Gen Zia and Gen Musharraf's education policies. It is hoped, with its limitations, the research may be useful for policymakers, professionals, researchers, and organizations to appreciate the role of politics and its subsequent influence on education. Different studies through different approaches are required to explore political intervention in this globalized world to depoliticize education policy formulation.

### References

- Afzal, M. (2016). Identity goes beyond Islam in Pakistan. *Foreign Policy*, 2.
- Afzal, M. (2018). *Pakistan under Siege. Extremism, Society and State*. Penguin Random House India.
- Ahmad, S. (2021). The Post 9/11 Enlightenment of Pakistan: An Analysis of Musharraf's Policy Perspective. *SJESR*, 4(1), 61-71.
- Ali, S., (2016). The sphere of authority; governing education policy in Pakistan amidst global pressure. *Globalization, Societies and Education*. Retrieved form: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/14767724.2015.1127575>
- Ali, S. (2005). The influence of globalization on the national education policies of developing countries. *Journal of Educational Research*, 8(1), 14-21.
- Aly J. H. (2007). *The White Paper*, Ministry of Education, 2008, Islamabad.
- Anderson, K. T., & Holloway, J. (2020). Discourse analysis as theory, method, and epistemology in studies of education policy. *Journal of Education Policy*, 35(2), 188-221.
- Apple, M. W. (2003). *The State and the Politics of Knowledge*. New York, NY: Routledge Falmer.
- Apple, M. W. (2004). *Ideology and Curriculum*. New York: Routledge Falmer.
- Atkinson, P. A. & Coffey, A. (1997). Analyzing Documentary Realities. In D. Silverman (Ed.), *Qualitative research: Theory, method and practice*, London: Sage, 45-62.
- Aziz, F., & Bukhari, S. N. B. (2021). Pakistani Education System and Reservations of religious Minorities: *Journal of Islamic Theology*, 3(1), 18-28.
- Berg, B. L. (2001). *Qualitative research methods for social sciences*. London: Allyn and Bacon.
- Biraimah, K., Gaudelli, W., & Zajda, J. (2008). Education and Social Inequality in the Global Culture. In J. Zajda, B. Biraimah, & W.

- Gaudelli (Eds.), *Education and Social Inequality in the Global Culture*. Dordrecht: Springer.
- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3(2), 77–91.
- Cohen, S. P. (2004). *The idea of Pakistan*. Brookings Institution Press.
- Corbin, J., & Strauss, A. (2008). *Basics of qualitative research: Techniques and procedures for developing grounded theory* (3rd Ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage
- Deacon, B. (1997). *Global social policy: International organizations and the future of welfare*. Sage
- Capella, J. R. (2000). Globalization, a Fading Citizenship. In N. C. Burbules & C. A. Torres (Eds.), *Globalization and education: Critical Perspectives* (pp. 227–251). London: Routledge.
- Fuller, G. E. (2003). *The Future of Political Islam*, New York: Palgrave Macmillan
- GoP (1979). National Education Policy. Islamabad: Ministry of Education
- GoP (2009). National Education Policy. Islamabad: Ministry of Education
- Haqqani, H (2005). *Pakistan: Between Mosque and Military; From Islamic Republic to Islamic State*. United States: Carnegie Endowment for International Peace.
- Hussain I., (2011) Is Islamization Persisting in Pakistani Education? An International Analysis. Speech at Civil Services Academy. Retrieved from: - <http://cppg.fccollege.edu.pk/is-islamization-persisting-in-pakistani-education-an-institutional-analysis/>
- Iqbal, H. M. (2011). *Education in Pakistan Developmental Milestones*. Karachi, Pakistan: Paramount Publishing Enterprise.
- Jamil, Bela Raza (2009). *Curriculum Reforms in Pakistan – A Glass Half Full or Half Empty?* Idara-e-Taleem-o-Aagahi. Retrieved from <http://www.itacec.org/document/nep09/NCERT%20Pakistan%20paper%20BRJ.pdf>
- Khushik, F., & Diemer, A. (2018). Critical Analysis of Education Policies in Pakistan: A Sustainable Development Perspective. *Social Science Learning Education Journal*, 3(09), 01-16.
- Kim, R. E. (2020). Is global governance fragmented, polycentric, or complex? The state of the art of the network approach. *International Studies Review*, 22(4), 903-931.
- Krippendorff, K. (2013). *Content Analysis: An Introduction to its Methodology*. Sage Publications.
- Mazrui A. A (2002). *Nkrumanizm and the Triple Heritage in the Shadow of Globalization* being a paper presented at the Aggrey-Fraser-Guggisberg Memorial Lectures, University of Ghana, Legon, and Accra.

- Merriam, S. B. (1988). *Case study research in education: A qualitative approach*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Prior, L. (2003). *Using documents in social research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Prior, L. (2012). The role of documents in social research. In S. Delamont (Ed.), *Handbook of qualitative research in education* (pp. 426–438). Cheltenham, UK: Edward Elgar.
- Robinson, M. (2008). Hybrid states: Globalization and the politics of state capacity. *Political Studies*, 56(3), 566-583.
- Rosenau, J. N. 1999. "Toward an Ontology for Global Governance." In *Approaches to Global Governance Theory*, edited by M. Hewson, and T. J. Sinclair, 287–301. Albany: State University of New York Press.
- Rosenau, J. N. (2000). "Governance, Order and Change in World Politics." In *Governance without government: Order and Change in World Politics*, edited by J. N. Rosenau and E. O. Czempiel, 1-29. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Shah, A. S. and Karamat, S. (2021). Evolution of Religious Political Parties in Pakistan during Military Regimes. *Evolution*, 6(1), 47-60.
- Syed, J.; Pio, E.; Kamran, T. & Zaidi, a (2016). Faith-Based Violence and Deobandi Militancy in Pakistan. *Springer*. p. 379.
- Yin, R. K. (2009). *Case Study Research, Design and Methods* (4th Ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage
- Zaman (2018). *An Islamic Approach to Inequality and Poverty* Journal of King Abdulaziz University: Islamic Economics, Vol. 31, No. 1, 2018
- Zia, R. (2003). Religion and Education in Pakistan: An overview. *Prospects* 33(2).